

11. Equality constrained minimization

- equality constrained minimization
- eliminating equality constraints
- Newton's method with equality constraints
- infeasible start Newton method
- implementation

Equality constrained minimization

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{minimize} & f(x) \\ \text{subject to} & Ax = b \end{array}$$

- f convex, twice continuously differentiable
- $A \in \mathbf{R}^{p \times n}$ with $\text{rank } A = p < n$ (fewer constraints than unknowns)
- we assume p^* is finite and attained

optimality conditions: x^* is optimal iff there exists a ν^* such that

$$\begin{array}{ll} \nabla f(x^*) + A^T \nu^* = 0, & Ax^* = b \\ \text{(stationarity)} & \text{(primal feasibility)} \end{array}$$

equality constrained quadratic minimization (with $P \in \mathbf{S}_+^n$)

$$\begin{aligned} &\text{minimize} && (1/2)x^T P x + q^T x + r \\ &\text{subject to} && Ax = b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} L(x,v) &= \frac{1}{2} x^T P x + q^T x + r + v^T (Ax - b) \\ 0 = dL/dx &= P x + q + A^T v \end{aligned}$$

optimality condition:

$$\begin{bmatrix} P & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x^* \\ v^* \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -q \\ b \end{bmatrix}$$

equivalent to:
 $P x^* + A^T v^* + q = 0$
 $A x^* = b$

- coefficient matrix is called KKT matrix , if non-singular \Rightarrow unique primal-dual pair (x^*, v^*)
- KKT matrix is nonsingular if and only if

P is pos.def. in the nullspace of A : $x = Fz$, where $z \succ 0$, rank $F = n-p$
 ($A = U D V^T$, columns of V for which $d_{ii}=0$ are the "axes" of the nullspace)

$$Ax = 0, \quad x \neq 0 \quad \implies \quad x^T P x > 0$$

Assume $Ax=0, x \succ 0, Px=0$, then $\begin{bmatrix} P & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ and thus, the KKT matrix is singular

Assume KKT is singular, there exists x in \mathbb{R}^n, z in \mathbb{R}^p such that $\begin{bmatrix} P & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ z \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$

thus, $Ax=0$ and $Px+A^T z=0 \Rightarrow 0 = x^T(Px+A^T z) = x^T Px + (Ax)^T z = x^T Px \Rightarrow Px = 0$ (which contradicts P pos.semidef. unless $x=0$)
 Then we must have $z \succ 0$, but then $0 = Px+A^T z = A^T z$ (which contradicts rank $A = p$)

Newton step

Newton step Δx_{nt} of f at feasible x is given by solution v of

$$\begin{bmatrix} \nabla^2 f(x) & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} v \\ w \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -\nabla f(x) \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

equivalent to:
 $d^2 f(x) v + A^T w + df(x) = 0$
 $A v = 0$

interpretations

- Δx_{nt} solves second order approximation (with variable v) **assume x is feasible: $Ax=b$
we want $Av=0$**

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{minimize} & \hat{f}(x+v) = f(x) + \nabla f(x)^T v + (1/2)v^T \nabla^2 f(x)v \\ \text{subject to} & A(x+v) = b \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} L(v,w) = df(x)'v + \frac{1}{2} v' d^2 f(x) v + w (Av) \\ 0 = dL/dv = df(x) + d^2 f(x) v + A^T w \end{array}$$

- Δx_{nt} equations follow from linearizing optimality conditions

$$\nabla f(x+v) + A^T w \approx \nabla f(x) + \nabla^2 f(x)v + A^T w = 0, \quad A(x+v) = b$$

Newton decrement

$$\lambda(x) = (\Delta x_{nt}^T \nabla^2 f(x) \Delta x_{nt})^{1/2} = (-\nabla f(x)^T \Delta x_{nt})^{1/2}$$

properties

$$p^* = \inf_{Ay=b} f(y)$$

- gives an estimate of $f(x) - p^*$ using quadratic approximation \hat{f} :

$$f(x) - \inf_{Ay=b} \hat{f}(y) = \frac{1}{2} \lambda(x)^2$$

Let $H = d^2 f(x)$

$d = df(x)$

$\lambda = \lambda(x)$

$\Delta x = \Delta x_{nt} = v$ in previous slide

$$\begin{bmatrix} H & A' \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta x \\ w \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -d \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta x \\ w \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

then: $A \Delta x = 0$

$$\hat{f}(x + \Delta x) = f(x) + d' \Delta x + \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x$$

$$L(\Delta x, w) = d' \Delta x + \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x + w' (A \Delta x)$$

$$0 = dL/d\Delta x = d + H \Delta x + A'w$$

$$\text{Then } d = -H \Delta x - A'w$$

$$H \Delta x = -d - A'w$$

Let $y = x + \Delta x$

$$\inf_{Ay=b} \hat{f}(y) = \hat{f}(x + \Delta x)$$

$$= f(x) + d' \Delta x + \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x$$

$$= f(x) - \Delta x' H \Delta x - w' A \Delta x + \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x \quad \dots \text{ since } d = -H \Delta x - A'w$$

$$= f(x) - \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x \quad \dots \text{ since } A \Delta x = 0$$

$$f(x) - \inf_y \hat{f}(y) = \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x = \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2$$

Thus $\lambda = \sqrt{\Delta x' H \Delta x}$

Similarly:

$$\inf_{Ay=b} \hat{f}(y) = \hat{f}(x + \Delta x)$$

$$= f(x) + d' \Delta x + \frac{1}{2} \Delta x' H \Delta x$$

$$= f(x) + d' \Delta x - \frac{1}{2} d' \Delta x - \frac{1}{2} w' A \Delta x \quad \dots \text{ since } H \Delta x = -d - A'w$$

$$= f(x) + \frac{1}{2} d' \Delta x \quad \dots \text{ since } A \Delta x = 0$$

$$f(x) - \inf_y \hat{f}(y) = -\frac{1}{2} d' \Delta x = \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2$$

Thus $\lambda = \sqrt{-d' \Delta x}$

Newton's method with equality constraints

given starting point $x \in \text{dom } f$ with $Ax = b$, tolerance $\epsilon > 0$.

repeat

1. Compute the Newton step and decrement $\Delta x_{\text{nt}}, \lambda(x)$.
2. *Stopping criterion.* **quit** if $\lambda^2/2 \leq \epsilon$.
3. *Line search.* Choose step size t by backtracking line search.
4. *Update.* $x := x + t\Delta x_{\text{nt}}$.

$A \Delta x = 0$, then $A t \Delta x = 0$ for any $t > 0$

if $df(x) \neq 0$
 $df(x)' \Delta x = -\lambda(x)^2 < 0$ (see slide 10-5)

• a feasible descent method: $x^{(k)}$ feasible and $f(x^{(k+1)}) < f(x^{(k)})$

• affine invariant $\min_{y} f(y) = f(T y)$ s.t. $A T y = b$ then $\Delta y = T^{-1} \Delta x$, $y^{(k)} = y + \Delta y = T^{-1} (x + \Delta x) = T^{-1} x^{(k)}$

$$x = T y, \quad \text{let } Hf(y) = d^2 f(y) \\ H = Hf(x), \quad d = df(x)$$

$$df(y) = T' df(T y) = T' d \\ Hf(y) = T' Hf(T y) \quad T = T' H T$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} Hf(y) & T'A' \\ A T & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta y \\ u \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -df(y) \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{Then } \begin{bmatrix} T' H T & T'A' \\ A T & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta y \\ w \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -T' d \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{Also } \begin{bmatrix} H & A' \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta x \\ w \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -d \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{Thus } \Delta x = T \Delta y$$

$$\Rightarrow \begin{bmatrix} T' H T \Delta y + T'A' w = -T' d \\ A T \Delta y = 0 \end{bmatrix} \Rightarrow \begin{bmatrix} H T \Delta y + A' w = -d \\ A T \Delta y = 0 \end{bmatrix} \quad (T \text{ nonsingular})$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} H \Delta x + A' w = -d \\ A \Delta x = 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

(Good if you dont want to find a feasible point to start the Newton method)

Newton step at infeasible points

2nd interpretation of page 11-6 extends to infeasible x (i.e., $Ax \neq b$)

linearizing optimality conditions at infeasible x (with $x \in \text{dom } f$) gives

$$\begin{bmatrix} \nabla^2 f(x) & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta x_{\text{nt}} \\ w \end{bmatrix} = - \begin{bmatrix} \nabla f(x) \\ Ax - b \end{bmatrix} \quad (1)$$

Although $Ax \neq b$, we want $A(x+\Delta x) = b$, thus $A \Delta x = -(Ax-b)$

primal-dual interpretation

- write optimality condition as $r(y) = 0$, where

$\min f(x)$
 $\text{s.t. } Ax=b$

$L(x,v) = f(x) + v(Ax-b)$
 $dL/dx = df(x) + A^T v = 0$

$$y = (x, \nu), \quad r(y) = (\nabla f(x) + A^T \nu, Ax - b)$$

- linearizing $r(y) = 0$ gives $r(y + \Delta y) \approx r(y) + Dr(y)\Delta y = 0$: (1st order Taylor)

Since $Dr(y) \Delta y = -r(y)$ we have:

$$\begin{bmatrix} \nabla^2 f(x) & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Delta x_{\text{nt}} \\ \Delta \nu_{\text{nt}} \end{bmatrix} = - \begin{bmatrix} \nabla f(x) + A^T \nu \\ Ax - b \end{bmatrix}$$

same as (1) with $w = \nu + \Delta \nu_{\text{nt}}$

$y=(x,\nu) \Rightarrow \Delta y=(\Delta x,\Delta \nu)$

$r(y)_1 = df(x)+A^T v$

$r(y)_2 = Ax-b$

$Dr(y)_{\{11\}} = d(r(y)_1)/dx = d(df(x)+A^T v)/dx = d^2 f(x)$

$Dr(y)_{\{12\}} = d(r(y)_1)/dv = d(df(x)+A^T v)/dv = A^T$

$Dr(y)_{\{21\}} = d(r(y)_2)/dx = d(Ax-b)/dx = A$

$Dr(y)_{\{22\}} = d(r(y)_2)/dv = d(Ax-b)/dv = 0$

Infeasible start Newton method

Since we want $r(y) = 0$, it is natural to try to decrease the norm of $r(y)$

given starting point $x \in \text{dom } f$, ν , tolerance $\epsilon > 0$, $\alpha \in (0, 1/2)$, $\beta \in (0, 1)$.

repeat

1. Compute primal and dual Newton steps Δx_{nt} , $\Delta \nu_{\text{nt}}$.

2. *Backtracking line search* on $\|r\|_2$.

$t := 1$.

while $\|r(x + t\Delta x_{\text{nt}}, \nu + t\Delta \nu_{\text{nt}})\|_2 > (1 - \alpha t)\|r(x, \nu)\|_2$, $t := \beta t$.

3. *Update*. $x := x + t\Delta x_{\text{nt}}$, $\nu := \nu + t\Delta \nu_{\text{nt}}$.

until $Ax = b$ and $\|r(x, \nu)\|_2 \leq \epsilon$.

- not a descent method: $f(x^{(k+1)}) > f(x^{(k)})$ is possible
- directional derivative of $\|r(y)\|_2$ in direction $\Delta y = (\Delta x_{\text{nt}}, \Delta \nu_{\text{nt}})$ is

$$\left. \frac{d}{dt} \|r(y + t\Delta y)\|_2 \right|_{t=0} = -\|r(y)\|_2$$

Thus, the norm of r decreases in the Newton direction

Solving KKT systems

$$\begin{bmatrix} H & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} v \\ w \end{bmatrix} = - \begin{bmatrix} g \\ h \end{bmatrix}$$

solution methods

- LDL^T factorization
- elimination (if H nonsingular)

$$\begin{aligned} H v + A^T w &= -g &\Rightarrow v &= -H^{-1} (g + A^T w) \\ A v &= -h &\Rightarrow -A H^{-1} g - A H^{-1} A^T w &= -h \\ &&&w &= (A H^{-1} A^T)^{-1} (h - A H^{-1} g) \end{aligned}$$

$$A H^{-1} A^T w = h - A H^{-1} g, \quad H v = -(g + A^T w)$$

- elimination with singular H : write as

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Originally: } & H v + A^T w = -g, \quad A v = -h \\ \text{Now: } & (H + A^T Q A) v + A^T w = -g - A^T Q h, \quad A v = -h \\ \text{Equivalent if: } & A^T Q A v = -A^T Q h \quad \dots \text{ true since } A v = -h \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} H + A^T Q A & A^T \\ A & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} v \\ w \end{bmatrix} = - \begin{bmatrix} g + A^T Q h \\ h \end{bmatrix}$$

with $Q \succeq 0$ for which $H + A^T Q A \succ 0$, and apply elimination

Recall: $Ax=0, x \succ 0 \Rightarrow x^T P x > 0$

Therefore $x^T (P + A^T Q A) x = x^T P x + |Q^{1/2} Ax|_2^2 > 0$